

queen can bridge international boundaries by selecting appropriately broad themes. How songs that include erotic content when vocalized for friends are revised when sung for scholars in chapter 5 demonstrates how song kings adapt to the mores of the cultures they find themselves in. A performance in Wang's home region after being away for a longer period of time in chapter 6 shows how the use of varying aspects of performance can be used to balance elements of the exotic and familiar. Finally, differing renderings of "The Infinite Bends of the Yellow River" that bring the personal, regional, and national together in chapter 7 speak to how song kings encourage listeners "to consider how their lives might also connect to larger metanarratives of struggle and success" (p. 205).

At its core, *Song King* is an effective subject-centered ethnography, which, like its main subject, reaches beyond itself to address the surrounding issues of the present. Gibbs supports numerous interactions and interviews with Wang Xiangrong (which occurred over three periods of fieldwork between 2006 and 2012) with news reports, the writings of Western and Chinese scholars, and additional interviews with acquaintances of Wang and his music. Theories covering issues of folklore, identity, and the role of past experiences are tastefully employed to enrich the narrative of Wang Xiangrong and his role as an expert mediator. While more could have been written about the traditional song genres that form the basis of Wang's singing knowledge, Gibbs does an admirable job balancing the significance of these ways of music making with the other performances fleshed out in this monograph. For those interested in hearing some of the songs discussed in the book, the track referencing Wang's 2006 CD provides the reader with the option of purchasing or previewing samples of the songs described in chapter 2 on Amazon.

This book will likely be most interesting to scholars in the fields of China studies, folklore, and ethnomusicology. It will also be useful to those seeking to understand how tradition in China is imagined in the present, constructed for performance, and placed before the global community. Concepts such as stageworthiness, mediation, and songs as sites for conversation, in addition to being useful themes for analyzing Chinese folk singing, may indeed be helpful frames for analyzing other forms of music and performance as they are presented and re-presented to ever-changing audiences.

JOHN H. WIDMAN

University of California, Los Angeles  
jwidman@ucla.edu

*A History of Modern Tibet, Volume 4, In the Eye of the Storm, 1957–1959.* By MELVYN GOLDSTEIN. Berkeley: University of California Press, 2019. 616 pp. ISBN: 9780520278554 (cloth). doi:10.1017/S0021911820000145

In March 1959, the Fourteenth Dalai Lama slipped out of Lhasa under the cover of darkness. Together with a small group of close officials and a handpicked guard of Tibetan soldiers, he crossed the Himalayas to India, where he embarked on a new life in exile. As word of his departure slowly spread across the Tibetan capital, the city erupted into open violence. When the battle ended, countless civilians, soldiers, and monks lay dead, and Tibet's already tenuous autonomy came to an abrupt end. In the years since the March Uprising, 1959 has been remembered as a pivotal moment in the history of Tibet and

serves an appropriate history of the March Uprising and the Chinese Revolution. In the 1950s, we need those not taken

*In the Eye of the Storm* traces them to their roots, particularly the traditional interpretation of the March Uprising. Goldstein hints at the need to reengage the Chinese in Tibet (p. 181). Having occupied Tibet, Goldstein's policy, Goldstein's Tibetan and Chinese avoiding an open

To this end, the steps taken by the People's Republic of China might antagonize the Lama and Khamba resistance (sum), and the Chinese Tibet's precarious take into consideration indigenous resistance

The deft maneuverance on both Tibet by a considerable impartiality, he leads Chinese and Tibet working toward in most Tibetans hate troops and cadres feudal exploiters o

<sup>1</sup>Melvyn C. Goldstein *The Lamaist State (Beijing: University of California Press, 2007)*; *My Tibet: A Personal History, 1955–1957* (Berkeley: University of California Press, 2008).  
<sup>2</sup>Most famous of these is by A. S. Akhmedov, "Review of A History of Modern Tibet by Melvyn C. Goldstein" (2008), <http://www.thlib.org>

serves an appropriate endpoint for Melvyn Goldstein's fourth and concluding volume on the history of modern Tibet, *In the Eye of the Storm*. Although the bloodshed of the 1959 March Uprising is often treated as an inevitable coda to the arrival of the People's Liberation Army and Chinese rule eight years earlier in 1951, Goldstein repeatedly and convincingly argues that to "fully understand the complex history of Sino-Tibet relations in the 1950s, we need to examine not only the roads taken by the actors, but also consider those not taken" (p. 490).

*In the Eye of the Storm* builds on many themes begun in his three earlier volumes, tracing them to their logical, and often harrowing, ends.<sup>1</sup> In this final volume, Goldstein is particularly tireless in his attempts to clearly demarcate the standard fault lines within traditional interpretations, assumptions, and suppositions surrounding the lead-up to the March Uprising. His approach stems less from a desire to overturn previous conclusions than to reengage the historical contingencies and paths not chosen. At numerous points, Goldstein hints at the perils of historical oversimplification while simultaneously cautioning that the "Sino-Tibetan historians of the 1950s in the West have generally viewed the Chinese in Tibet as monolithic entity with a homogeneous set of views and policies" (p. 181). Having encountered accusations of being pro-Chinese, glorifying the Chinese occupation of Tibet, and otherwise promoting an uncritical acceptance of Chinese policy, Goldstein repeatedly presents evidence of good-faith efforts by both the Tibetan and Chinese governments to pursue policies which were explicitly intent on avoiding an open conflict between Tibetan and Chinese forces right up until early 1959.<sup>2</sup>

To this end, one of the study's greatest contributions is its ability to neatly delineate the steps taken by the Tibetan and Chinese governments to maintain Tibetan autonomy within the People's Republic of China (PRC) while assiduously avoiding actions that might antagonize the other. Goldstein presents in fascinating detail how the Dalai Lama and Kashag (Tibetan Government Council) sought to balance the work of Khamba resistance fighters (Chushigandru), anti-Chinese exiled Tibetans (Jenkhentsi-sum), and the Central Intelligence Agency (CIA) with their broader goal of ensuring Tibet's precarious autonomy under the PRC. In doing so, the reader is admonished to take into consideration the many internal, external, and practical obstacles that prevented indigenous resistance from emerging as a viable option for the Tibetan leadership.

The deft manner in which such events are presented underscores Goldstein's reliance on both Tibetan and Chinese source material (collected, translated, and organized by a considerable team of students, assistants, and other scholars). With patience and impartiality, he lays out the complex and constantly shifting tensions facing both Chinese and Tibetan actors. Taking remarkable care to point out that though perhaps working toward incompatible ends, they were motivated by similar emotions: "just as most Tibetans hated the presence of Chinese army troops in their city, most Chinese troops and cadres hated having to act cordial to the Tibetan elite, who they considered feudal exploiters of the masses, as well as to the Lhasa residents who harassed them

<sup>1</sup>Melvyn C. Goldstein and Gelek Rimpoche, *A History of Modern Tibet, 1913–1951: The Demise of the Lamaist State* (Berkeley: University of California Press, 1989); Melvyn C. Goldstein, *A History of Modern Tibet: Volume 2, The Calm Before the Storm, 1951–1955* (Berkeley: University of California Press, 2007); Melvyn C. Goldstein, *A History of Modern Tibet, Volume 3: The Storm Clouds Descend, 1955–1957* (Berkeley: University of California Press, 2013).

<sup>2</sup>Most famous of these critiques is that posed by Matthew Akester in his review of volume 2. See Akester, "Review of *A History of Modern Tibet, Volume 2: The Calm before the Storm, 1951–1955* by Melvyn C. Goldstein," *Journal of the International Association of Tibet Studies*, no. 4 (December 2008), [http://www.thlib.org/collections/texts/jiats/#!jiats=/04/rev\\_goldstein/b1/](http://www.thlib.org/collections/texts/jiats/#!jiats=/04/rev_goldstein/b1/).

on the street, shoving and spitting at them. . . . So angry emotions were present on both sides" (p. 446). With impressive equanimity, *In the Eye of the Storm* resists slipping into an all-too-tempting narrative that uncritically valorizes the Tibetan resistance or uniformly disparages Chinese motives and actions in Tibet.

As with the earlier volumes, Goldstein unabashedly embraces page-long quotes, juxtaposes multiple firsthand accounts of a single event, and highlights contradictory individual recollections of the same incident. All of this is done with a concern for accuracy and precision that might vex some nonspecialists but will enthrall those students of Tibet seeking a fuller picture of the events leading up to the March Uprising. Much of his narrative draws on hundreds of hours of oral interviews that he and his team conducted with prominent Tibetan and Chinese figures (with the original Tibetan audio and written English translation have been made available as part of the Tibet Oral History Archive Project, an online archive in the Asian Division of the Library of Congress). He also obtained a "sizable group of very important Chinese government archival documents" (p. xvi) in India that will also be made publicly available. In essence, Goldstein and his team have created out of whole cloth multiple searchable databases of interviews, letters, and documents that will provide future historians of Tibet with an invaluable source base. This is an achievement even more praiseworthy in light of the fact that the CIA and National Security Agency released "virtually no documents," and relevant Chinese government archives are essentially off-limits to foreign scholars (p. xvi).

With *In the Eye of the Storm*, Goldstein completes a journey that he began thirty years ago with the publication of *The Demise of the Lamaist State*. This final volume—equal in length, style, and precision to each of the first three volumes—is an eloquent and forceful culmination of the four-volume history. Taken as a whole, *A History of Modern Tibet* is a seminal work that will serve as the authoritative history of Tibet for generations to come.

DAVID G. ATWILL  
Penn State University  
dगतwill@psu.edu

*Voting as a Rite: A History of Elections in Modern China.* By JOSHUA HILL.  
Cambridge, Mass.: Harvard University Asia Center, 2019. 298 pp. ISBN:  
9780674237223 (paper).  
doi:10.1017/S0021911820000157

*Voting as a Rite* is a clearly written, persuasively argued, rigorously researched, and highly readable account of the role of elections in twentieth-century China, the first English-language monograph devoted to this important subject. Examining textual material and political events from the late Qing to the Reform era on the mainland and the end of martial law on Taiwan, it places particular emphasis on the period from 1898 to 1921, when China conducted its first large-scale practical experiments with voting. It positions itself as an "intellectual history of Chinese elections" (p. 4) while also deeply engaging with elections as a social and political practice, drawing not only on theoretical discussions but also on firsthand accounts of voting procedures, manuals, handbooks, voter lists, and other archival findings. Jiangsu Province plays a central role in the study, but other areas are also discussed in detail (notably, Hunan and Guangdong).

Like other (press), election tices. Simply p way of express in two main w translation of t tion system wa tion and appo (*shang xia tong* As Hill sets ou visions of elec and pessimisti over public go

The intric Assembly Elec Tianjin in 190 as a tool to ref nize" commu former (p. 70 proved elusive scattered in th to designate th this as a sign o tice of "camp the beginning

The 1908 : next decades. U chise significar ing represental than in 1909 b (in particular i national electic

Two chap Chinese Com post-1949 atti expanding the People's Repu small groups o sion of the fra 22, which brol Hunan held a of "political tu zens, but intr oath taking fo be postponed, the regularly h out the martia the PRC, elec pressing recor



# ASIAN

STUDIES

Volume 79 • Number 2 • May 2020

PUBLISHED FOR  
THE ASSOCIATION FOR  
ASIAN STUDIES

**CAMBRIDGE**  
UNIVERSITY PRESS