EXAMINING RESILIENCE
Among Maltreated Children

BACKGROUND
Child maltreatment is a serious public health issue—an estimated 702,000 U.S. children were victims of maltreatment in 2014, a rate of 9.4 per 1,000 children.1 Childhood maltreatment puts children at risk for lifelong poor outcomes.2 However, emerging research examines the importance of protective factors and promoting resilience. Researchers at Case Western Reserve University recently completed a study examining how protective factors promote long-term resilience for maltreated children.

Child maltreatment takes many forms, including neglect, physical abuse, emotional/psychological abuse, and sexual abuse. The majority of all maltreatment victims are neglected (75.0%), followed by physically abused (17.0%) and sexually abused (8.3%).1 In Ohio, there were 24,931 victims of child abuse in 2014, a rate of 9.4 per 1,000 children, identical to the national average.1 Although data varies on the prevalence of maltreatment by age, interest in sensitive periods of child development suggests that maltreatment during earlier periods may be especially harmful in disrupting development, though maltreatment at any point can be harmful.3

The Ecological Model of child development (Figure 1) illustrates how multiple levels of a child’s environment, from the individual to the family to the larger community to society as a whole, shape a child’s development.4 At the individual level, impulse control, positive self-esteem, and optimism have been associated with greater resilience after maltreatment.5 Within the family, nurturing parenting skills and family stability are protective against child maltreatment.6 Similarly, factors outside of the family can influence both the prevalence of maltreatment within a community and outcomes for children who are maltreated. These include adequate housing, access to social services and caring non-family adults in a larger social network. Neighborhoods with stronger social networks and support, especially across generational lines, have lower rates of all types of child maltreatment.7 Although structural factors, such as neighborhood poverty and housing instability, can contribute to higher rates of

continued next page>
maltreatment, social connectedness and collective efficacy within neighborhoods can help to mediate the effects of structural factors and work to prevent child maltreatment. Emerging strategies to improve neighborhood social support networks, such as the Strong Communities for Children initiative, have found success in increasing social connectedness and decreasing parenting stress.

Preventing child maltreatment and promoting resilience has lifelong benefits for children. At the individual level, studies of Adverse Childhood Experiences (ACEs), including child maltreatment, have shown that children with multiple ACEs have a higher risk of poor outcomes such as alcoholism, drug abuse, depression, smoking, physical inactivity and obesity. Still, some children fare better than others, leading researchers to investigate what promotes resilience in children who have experienced maltreatment. Social relationships, such as a stable family environment and supportive relationships with adults, and individual factors, such as increased self-efficacy and coping skills, have been associated with increased resilience following maltreatment. Promoting safe, stable and nurturing relationships has been identified by the CDC as a key strategy for preventing child maltreatment. Interventions targeted at breaking intergenerational cycles of violence can promote well-being for many years to come. Five key strategies have been identified to break the cycle:

1. Effective early intervention
2. Care for neglected children
3. Interventions tailored to the needs of the child
4. Public health surveillance programs that respect children’s racial and ethnic backgrounds, and
5. Access to resources, including social services and interventions.

Reducing neighborhood violence and disadvantage also may play an important role in breaking the cycle of violence.

Despite research pointing to multiple risk factors associated with poorer outcomes for maltreated children, not all children display such problems. In fact, some children continue to thrive and achieve adaptive development despite early adverse life events. Instead of focusing on the negative outcomes of maltreated children, Case Western Reserve University Assistant Professor Megan Holmes, PhD, and colleagues, Adam Perzynski, PhD, Susan Yoon, MSW, and Julia Kobulsky, MA, took a strength-based perspective and asked the question, "What makes maltreated children resilient?" Specifically, they examined potential protective factors at the individual-, relationship-, and neighborhood-level that promoted resilient behavior despite experiences of maltreatment.

Although data varies on the prevalence of maltreatment by age, interest in sensitive periods of child development suggests that maltreatment during earlier periods may be especially harmful in disrupting development.
Three independent studies of *Academic Performance*, *Internalizing Symptoms*, and *Early Substance Use* were conducted to examine resilient behavior among maltreated children. All three studies examined how different protective factors impacted resilience. Individual-, relationship-, and neighborhood-level protective factors were used to predict resilient outcomes (Table 1).

**Academic Performance**: Holmes and Perzynski examined academic competence using a sample of 1,772 children who were between the ages of birth and 5 years old at the first time point.

**Internalizing Symptoms**: Yoon looked at internalizing symptoms (anxiety and depression) using a sample of 541 children who were between the ages of 4 and 5 years old at the first time point.

**Early Substance Use**: Kobulsky studied early adolescent substance use among a sample of 796 youth ages 11-13 at the first time point.

FINDINGS

Researchers found that children who experienced maltreatment fell into distinct categories over time, some resilient, others facing challenges.

**Academic Performance Study**

Holmes and Perzynski identified five patterns of academic performance indicating that children have diverse pathways of development over time (Figure 2). Two resilient groups were identified: Group 1 (21.5%) demonstrated high and stable performance over time. Group 2 (20.1%) started low but increased in performance over time. The other three groups were identified as: Group 3 (19.9%) demonstrated low and stable academic performance over time; Group 4 (21.4%) had an initial high performance but decreased over time; and Group 5 (17.1%) had an initial high performance then decreased but then increased again with subsequent decline over time.

Despite research pointing to multiple risk factors associated with poorer outcomes for maltreated children, not all children display such problems.
Children who experienced physical abuse when 3 or 4 years of age or neglect during the period from birth to 2 years had higher odds of being in the low stable academic performance group (Group 3) compared to the high stable group (Group 1). There were no significant differences in terms of maltreatment for children in the decreasing internalizing symptoms group (Group B) compared to the increasing internalizing symptoms group (Group C). Higher levels of prosocial skills and higher caregiver well-being were identified as protective factors for the consistently low internalizing symptoms group (Group A) compared to the other two groups (Group B and Group C).

**DISCUSSION**

Considering the diversity of outcomes for academic performance and internalizing symptoms patterns, it is clear that not all maltreated children develop maladaptive outcomes, and that some children exhibit resilient behavior over time. Interpreted within Bronfenbrenner’s biocological framework, the presence of distinct patterns of development may indicate that children’s behaviors are constantly influenced by multiple levels of risk and protective factors. Researchers found that children who experienced maltreatment fell into distinct categories over time, some resilient, others facing challenges.
Considering the diversity of outcomes for academic performance and internalizing symptoms patterns, it is clear that not all maltreated children develop maladaptive outcomes, and that some children exhibit resilient behavior over time.

Although physical abuse was not significantly related to internalizing symptoms in younger children in the Internalizing Symptoms study, in the Early Substance Use study of older children, physical abuse severity was associated with higher internalizing symptoms, which in turn was associated with early substance use. This mediated relationship suggests that internal well-being may be a pathway connecting physical abuse to early substance use. However, the limited strength of this connection underscores early substance use as a complex phenomenon with a wide range of contributing factors (e.g., community environmental factors).

The results of both the Internalizing Symptoms and the Early Substance Use studies suggest that sexual abuse may be related to a delayed but long-lasting impact on children’s internalizing symptoms and substance use, suggesting the importance of ongoing monitoring of outcomes for sexually abused children. For example, the relationship between sexual abuse and post-traumatic stress may impact substance use via the development of later substance use disorder.

Two protective factors at the individual- and three protective factors at the relationship-level were associated with resilient behavior. The Early Substance Use study found that internal well-being mediated the relationship between physical abuse severity and early substance use, consistent with some past research but contrary to other analyses examining older adolescents. Consistent with previous research reporting an inverse relationship between prosocial skills and internalizing symptoms, the Internalizing Symptoms study found that higher child prosocial skills were associated with consistently low internalizing symptoms over time (Group A). Children with prosocial behaviors often have strong emotional bonds and positive social interactions with others, which may reduce feelings of isolation or loneliness and prevent the development of internalizing symptoms.

Green lines indicate the two resilient groups. Group A had consistently low internalizing symptoms over time. Group B started out having high internalizing symptoms but then decreased to moderate level of symptoms over time. Group C started out having low internalizing symptoms but then increased in symptoms over time.
Caregiver well-being also significantly predicted children being in the consistently low internalizing symptoms group (Group A). This is consistent with previous research that has suggested caregiver depression, alcohol abuse, and drug dependence as important underlying mechanisms for children’s internalizing behavior problems over time.24–26

Caregiver warmth and cognitive responsiveness also were strong predictors of children being in the resilient groups for academic progress (Group 1 and Group 2). Consistent with past cross-sectional research with maltreated children, high levels of sensitive and stimulating parenting (e.g., appropriate cognitive/verbal responsiveness) has been associated with positive cognitive outcomes.21 By examining outcomes longitudinally, the results suggest that such protective factors may have the potential to change the course of development despite early maltreatment experiences. Support for caregiver’s emotional and mental health is key for promoting effective and warm caregiving.

Neighborhood safety was not significantly associated with diverse patterns of internalizing or academic competence trajectories. One possible explanation for this lack of association may be that neighborhood influences may not affect child outcomes until closer to adolescence when children are likely to spend more time with peers in the neighborhood, have more contact with people living in the neighborhood, and become involved with community activities.21

These studies were funded through the Department of Health and Human Services, Administration for Children and Families, Children’s Bureau, Grant #90CA1817. The contents of this publication do not necessarily reflect the views or policies of the funders, nor does mention of trade names, commercial products, or organizations imply endorsement by the U.S. Department of Health and Human Services. This information is in the public domain. Readers are encouraged to copy and share it, but please credit authors.

Children with prosocial behaviors often have strong emotional bonds and positive social interactions with others.
POLICY Implications

Responses to child maltreatment take two primary forms: programs designed to prevent maltreatment and programs in response to maltreatment. Researchers agree that the foundations of lifelong health are best laid during early childhood.32

Nurse home visiting programs, where nurses visit pregnant women and young families, have been shown to be effective in reducing child maltreatment, improving childhood quality of care, and promoting beneficial outcomes for children through adolescence.32–34 In Cuyahoga County, the Welcome Home Newborn Visiting Program and Bright Beginnings Home Visiting Program provides parents with home visits from a registered nurse within the first six weeks of life, though funding continues to be a challenge in delivering services.35 A 2004 evaluation in Cuyahoga County found that the programs studied were effective in improving parenting outcomes, though many children were still not reached, even after being referred to the program.36 The Triple P-Positive Parenting Program also has strong evidence that it reduces child maltreatment and improves parenting skills.32 As noted above, strong relationships within a neighborhood and community7,8 and supportive relationships with adults5 promote child abuse prevention and resilience after child maltreatment has occurred. Programs that provide children with high quality early childhood education, such as Head Start, Early Head Start and PRE4CLE, Cleveland’s initiative to provide access to high quality preschool for all children, plays an important role in connecting families with their communities, promoting relationships between children and other supportive adults and connecting to services.37 Researchers also have identified the preschool to kindergarten transition as a particularly important part of child development,38 with social-emotional school readiness just as important as academic school readiness in positive school experiences.39,40

Creating effective responses to child maltreatment that promote resiliency is another key component of child maltreatment intervention. Sufficient funding for child protective services is necessary to ensure children receive evidence-based care, including improving the quality of care and reducing the amount of time spent in out-of-home care. The Annie E. Casey Foundation, a leader in child maltreatment policy, recommends restructuring federal funding to improve permanency and reduce the amount of time children spend in residential care; to improve the quality of and support for foster care families; to promote a more capable child welfare workforce; and to fund both therapeutic and social services for families and children.41 Unfortunately, federal foster care payments decreased 40% and funding to support vulnerable families decreased 26%, from 2002 to 2011.42

Policy responses should promote factors that are associated with resilience in maltreated children, including stable family environments, supportive relationships, and high quality and individually tailored social services.5,13 Interventions to improve children’s environments, such as increasing social connectedness within neighborhoods and reducing neighborhood poverty can play a key role in preventing child maltreatment and promoting positive parenting.7,8,15 Sufficient state and federal funding is needed for research to ensure that policies and programs related to child maltreatment are evidence-based and effective.14


